NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

STATE OF NEW YORK

SUPREME COURT

COUNTY OF ERIE

ROBERT D. PLANTER 171 Streif Road Elma, New York 14059

and

JANICE M. PLANTER 171 Streif Road Elma, New York 14059

Plaintiffs

VS.

SUMMONS

PASCAL D. IPOLITO 303 Meyer Road, Apt. 704 West Seneca, New York 14224

and

DIOCESE OF BUFFALO, NEW YORK 795 Main Street Buffalo, New York 14203

Defendants

TO THE ABOVE NAMED DEFENDANTS:

YOU ARE HEREBY SUMMONED to answer the Complaint in this action, and to serve a copy of your Answer, or, if the Complaint is not served with a Summons, to serve a Notice of Appearance on Plaintiffs' attorney within 20 days after the service of this Summons, exclusive of the day of service, or within 30 days after completion of service where service is made in any other manner than by personal delivery within the State. In case of your failure to appear or answer, judgment will be taken against you by default for the relief demanded in the Complaint.

Erie County is designated as the place of trial on the basis of the residence of the Plaintiffs.

Dated: August 14, 2019

Williamsville, New York

Eric B. Grossman

Law Office of Eric B. Grossman

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

Office and Post Office Address 5820 Main Street, Suite 306

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

Williamsville, New York 14221 (716) 634-0000

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

STATE OF NEW YORK

SUPREME COURT

COUNTY OF ERIE

ROBERT D. PLANTER and JANICE M. PLANTER

Plaintiffs

VS.

COMPLAINT

PASCAL D. IPOLITO and DIOCESE OF BUFFALO, NEW YORK

Defendants

The plaintiffs in the above-entitled action, by their attorneys, Law Office of Eric B. Grossman, as and for their complaint against the defendants herein state as follows:

AS AND FOR A FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF, ROBERT D. PLANTER

- 1. That at all the times hereinafter mentioned, the plaintiffs were and presently are residents of the Town of Elma, County of Erie and State of New York.
- 2. That, upon information and belief, at all the times hereinafter mentioned, the defendant, Pascal D. Ipolito (hereinafter referred to as "Ipolito") was and presently is a resident of the Town of West Seneca, County of Erie and State of New York.
- 3. That, upon information and belief, at all the times hereinafter mentioned, the defendant, Diocese of Buffalo, New York (hereafter referred to as "Diocese"), was and presently is a not-for-profit domestic corporation organized and existing pursuant to the Laws of the State of New York, with an office for the transaction of business situate at 795 Main Street in the City of Buffalo, County of Erie and State of New York.

ERIE COUNTY CLERK 08/14/2019

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

4. That the within action is being commenced pursuant to the provisions of the recently-enacted Child Victims Act, in accordance with CPLR Sections 208(b) and 214(g).

- 5. That the said plaintiff was born in 1958 and was under eighteen (18) years of age at all times relevant herein.
- 6. That at all the times hereinafter mentioned, the defendant, Diocese, hired, retained, employed and assigned the defendant, Ipolito, to serve as a priest, pastor and/or member of the clergy of the defendant, Diocese, primarily serving at Annunciation Roman Catholic Church, situate in the Town of Elma, County of Erie and State of New York.
- 7. That in addition to the services on behalf of the Diocese hereinabove referenced, the defendant, Ipolito, was also hired, employed and/or retained for the purpose of providing guidance, mentoring, counseling and developing rapport with parishioners, students, boys and young men, including, but not limited to the plaintiff.
- 8. That in addition to the foregoing, the defendant, Diocese, also hired, retained and employed the defendant, Ipolito, for the purpose of establishing and developing said defendant's Catholic Youth Organization (hereinafter referred to "CYO"), requiring and/or strongly encouraging the defendant, Ipolito, to further interact with students and children within the Elma Community and the Annunciation Roman Catholic Church.
- 9. That the defendant, Diocese, in the employment, retention and hiring of the defendant, Ipolito, fully expected the said defendant to interact with students,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

boys and children within the parish, to be alone with minor parishioners, including the plaintiff, and to have unfettered and unsupervised access and control of them, as

bio president, and to start o announced and announced vision and contain of the first, as

the defendant, Ipolito, was held out, falsely so, to be a nurturing and supportive

priest and pastor within the community and local parish.

10. That upon information and belief, the defendant, Ipolito, in

furtherance of the duties required by the defendant, Diocese, reached out to close

family member and friends within the local parish and community to encourage

support and access to young boys, including but not limited to the plaintiff.

11. That prior to the events and occurrences more fully set forth herein,

the defendant, Ipolito, under the direction and/or control of the defendant, Diocese,

had occasion to transport the said plaintiff and other boys in a camper for a week-

long outing, without any direction or control from other adults.

12. That during the aforesaid camping outing that took place in the

vicinity of the Thousand Islands in New York State, the defendant, Ipolito, furnished

and supplied alcohol to the said plaintiff and others in his company, with full

knowledge that plaintiff and the others were all minors under the age of eighteen

(18) years, and in so doing, was unlawfully dealing with minor children, contrary to

the Penal Law of the State of New York and was "grooming" them to gain their

confidence and trust.

13. That the defendant, Ipolito, in supplying and furnishing alcohol to the

said plaintiff and others, had begun the process of gaining the trust of the plaintiff

and others, in an attempt to secure their cooperation and assistance with future

5

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

events or outings, all with the actual and/or constructive knowledge and notice of

the defendant, Diocese.

14. That heretofore and on or about the 30th day of August, 1975, while in

the Town of Elma, New York the defendant, Ipolito, conferred with the plaintiff, then

only seventeen 17 years of age, and made plans to drive the plaintiff in said

defendant's vehicle to Toronto, Ontario, Canada for the weekend, with the express

purpose of taking the plaintiff to see the Beach Boys perform at Toronto's CNE

Grand Stand.

15. That in addition to his plans to drive to Toronto and attend the

concert with the plaintiff, the said defendant also made arrangements for hotel

accommodations at the Sheridan Airport Hotel, located in or near Toronto.

16. That during the course of August 30, 1975 and August 31, 1975, the

said defendant, while acting under the direction and control of the defendant,

Diocese, as its priest and pastor, furnished and supplied whiskey and more

particularly, whiskey sours, to the said plaintiff for the purpose of getting the said

plaintiff intoxicated, thereby rendering the said plaintiff sleepy, groggy, incoherent

and generally unaware of his surroundings and sound judgment and in a position to

frequently pass out and lose consciousness during the course of the consumption of

whiskey sours provided to him by the defendant, Ipolito.

17. That, upon information and belief, at all the times hereinabove

mentioned, the defendant, Ipolito, knowingly and deliberately opted to unlawfully

deal with a minor with the hope and desire to cause the said plaintiff to lose

consciousness and awareness of his surroundings, for the ultimate objective of

6

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

conducting premeditated and unauthorized sexual abuse against the plaintiff, which

the said plaintiff neither consented to nor was legally able to do.

18. That on or about August 30, 1975 and/or August 31, 1975, the

plaintiff was caused to repeatedly pass out and lose consciousness as a result of the

consumption of large quantities of whiskey furnished by the defendant, Ipolito, and

during the short period of time in which the plaintiff eventually became conscious

and aware of his surroundings, the said plaintiff found the defendant, Ipolito, on top

of him, naked and engaging in unlawful and unconsented sexually deviant behavior,

lewd and lascivious conduct and sexual molestation.

19. That the aforesaid bodily conduct and contact constituted, among

other things, a violation of the Penal Law of the State of New York, as such unilateral

action was performed neither with the express consent of the plaintiff nor the

implied consent, since the plaintiff was not in a position of consenting to the sexual

abuse and lewd and lascivious conduct he endured at the hands of the said

defendant.

20. That the harmful, offensive and deeply disturbing conduct performed

by the said defendant, Ipolito, constituted a battery.

21. That the defendant, Diocese, knew or should have known of the

defendant, Ipolito's prior history and reputation of perverted sexual inclination,

sexual molestation and sexual abuse against children yet the defendant, Diocese,

failed to disayow, halt, cease, control, deter and isolate the defendant, Ipolito and

failed to report his crimes to police and/or authorities and accordingly, is

responsible for his actions under the theory of respondeat superior.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

22. That the said plaintiff sustained physical, psychological and/or other injuries or conditions suffered as a result of conduct that would constitute a "sexual

offense" as defined in the Penal Law of the State of New York and as more fully set

forth in Section 214(g) of the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

23. That the defendant, Diocese, while facing an onslaught of past and

likely future claims involving allegations of sexual abuse against children, opted to

establish the Independent Reconciliation and Compensation Program (hereinafter

referred to as "I.R.C.P.") for the purpose of attempting to ascertain the validity and

credibility of such claims.

24. That the said plaintiff, having recently been invited to participate in

the I.R.C.P. process, submitted proof in compliance with his claim and furnished

testimony and details to administrators and investigators retained by the defendant,

Diocese, and/or affiliated with I.R.C.P., resulting in a finding by the I.R.C.P, its

investigators and the defendant, Diocese, that plaintiff's claim has been

substantiated, and resulting in the defendant, Diocese, tendering an offer of

settlement, which offer has been rejected in all respects by the said plaintiff.

25. That by reason of the foregoing, the plaintiff, Robert D. Planter, was

caused to become sick, sore, lame, disabled and subjected to significant

psychological and emotional trauma and was prevented from attending to his usual

duties and occupation, and was compelled to secure medical care and attention and

may, in the future, be compelled to secure additional medical care and attention in

an effort to heal his said injuries, all to his damage in a sum exceeding the

jurisdictional limits of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

8

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

AS AND FOR A SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF

26. That the plaintiffs repeat, reiterate and reallege each and every

allegation contained and set forth in paragraphs marked and numbered "1" through

"25", all inclusive, of this complaint with the same force and effect as though the

same were more fully set forth herein.

27. That prior to, during and subsequent to the sexual abuse, battery and

physical contact forced upon the said plaintiff by the defendant, Ipolito, the said

plaintiff has been placed in and continues to feel an imminent sensation and/or

apprehension of harmful and offensive conduct, including, but not limited to, having

sustained further apprehension for imminent concern of further sexual contact and

abuse.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

28. That the said plaintiff sustained physical, psychological, emotional and

other injuries as a direct and proximate result of the sexual abuse and predatory

actions of the defendant, Ipolito, so as to cause the said plaintiff to have had fear and

anxiety and continue to fear further harmful and offensive sexual contact as a result

of being assaulted.

29. That the defendant, Diocese, knew or should have known of the

defendant, Ipolito's prior history and reputation of being a sexual predator and

engaging in sexual abuse of children, yet failed to act or intervene to stop such

sexual abuse and contact and further, allowed defendant Ipolito's sexual predatory

actions and sexual abuse of children and the plaintiff to continue unfettered and

without any ramifications whatsoever and accordingly, the defendant, Diocese,

bears responsibility under the theory of respondent superior.

9

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

30. That by reason of the foregoing, the plaintiff, Robert D. Planter, was caused to become sick, sore, lame, disabled and subjected to significant physical, psychological and emotional trauma and other conditions and was prevented from attending to his usual duties and occupation, and was compelled to secure medical care and attention and may, in the future, be compelled to secure additional medical care and attention in an effort to heal his said injuries all to his damage in a sum exceeding the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

AS AND FOR A THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF

- 31. That the plaintiffs repeat, reiterate and reallege each and every allegation contained and set forth in paragraphs marked and numbered "1" through "30", all inclusive, of this complaint with the same force and effect as though the same were more fully set forth herein.
- 32. That the defendant, Ipolito, intentionally, wantonly, recklessly and willfully "groomed" the said plaintiff into a position of loyalty and trust, leading the said plaintiff to become vulnerable and capable of being placed in a compromised position, leading to the despicable acts of sexual abuse committed against a child.
- 33. That as a consequence of the misconduct, sexual abuse, and Penal Law violations committed against the said plaintiff, he was caused to sustain severe, emotional distress, including physical, psychological, and emotional harm, all flowing from defendant, Ipolito's willful, wanton, reckless and intentional conduct.
- 34. That prior to the sexual abuse which took place and during the earlier "grooming" process, the defendant, Ipolito, was acting under the course and scope of

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

his employment with the defendant, Diocese, and the defendant, Diocese, had prior

actual or constructive knowledge and notice that the defendant, Ipolito, had

previously engaged in such behavior and, accordingly, the defendants are liable for

the intentional infliction of emotional distress, and the defendant, Diocese, is liable

under the theory of respondeat superior.

35. That by reason of the foregoing, the plaintiff, Robert D. Planter, was

caused to become sick, sore, lame, disabled and subjected to significant physical,

psychological, emotional trauma and other conditions and was prevented from

attending to his usual duties and occupation, and was compelled to secure medical

care and attention and may, in the future, be compelled to secure additional medical

care and attention in an effort to heal his said injuries all to his damage in a sum

exceeding the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts which would otherwise have

jurisdiction.

AS AND FOR A FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION
ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF

36. That the plaintiffs repeat, reiterate and reallege each and every

allegation contained and set forth in paragraphs marked and numbered "1" through

"35", all inclusive, of this complaint with the same force and effect as though the

same were more fully set forth herein.

37. That as a consequence of the "grooming" by the defendant, Ipolito of

the plaintiff and his luring the said plaintiff into a compromising position, the said

plaintiff was caused to sustain severe, physical, emotional, and psychological

distress.

11

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

38. That the defendant, Diocese, carelessly and negligently allowed the pattern of sexual abuse committed by the defendant, Ipolito, to go unfettered and without consequence, despite prior actual and/or constructive knowledge and notice of defendant Ipolito's pattern of similar behavior and abuse and accordingly,

the defendants are liable for the negligent infliction of emotional distress,

committed against the said plaintiff.

jurisdiction.

39. That by reason of the foregoing, the plaintiff, Robert D. Planter, was caused to become sick, sore, lame, disabled and subjected to significant physical, psychological and emotional trauma and other conditions and was prevented from attending to his usual duties and occupation, and was compelled to secure medical care and attention and may, in the future, be compelled to secure additional medical care and attention in an effort to heal his said injuries all to his damage in a sum exceeding the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts which would otherwise have

AS AND FOR A FIFTH CAUSE OF ACTION ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF

- 40. That the plaintiffs repeat, reiterate and reallege each and every allegation contained and set forth in paragraphs marked and numbered "1" through "39", all inclusive, of this complaint with the same force and effect as though the same were more fully set forth herein.
- 41. That at the time, defendant Ipolito was under consideration to be hired and/or retained as a pastor or priest for the defendant, Diocese, the defendant, Diocese, knew that Ipolito would serve as a spiritual counselor, role model and mentor for students, children and boys, including the said plaintiff, and defendant,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

Diocese, owed a duty to the plaintiff, and others, that their safety and security would

be of paramount concern and would be protected.

42. That at the time the defendant, Ipolito, was considered for

employment within the Diocese, the defendant, Diocese, was careless and negligent

in its hiring, supervising, directing and/or controlling the defendant, Ipolito, and as

a result, failed to protect the plaintiff from conduct of a known sexual predator or

someone with significant "red flags" in his background.

43. That prior to the sexual abuse and assault committed by the

defendant, Ipolito, against the plaintiff, defendant, Diocese, had a duty to exercise

due and reasonable care in the hiring, retention and appointment of clergy,

including Ipolito, so as to prevent the likelihood of dangerous individuals, including

molesters and sexual predators from being placed within the local perish and the

community.

44. That, upon information and belief, the defendant, Diocese, was

careless and negligent and failed to use reasonable care in the hiring of defendant,

Ipolito, failed to properly investigate his background, employment history and

references, and failed to take appropriate safeguards to protect the plaintiff, and

others within the parish and community from the defendant, Ipolito, knowing or

having reason to know of his prior history of sexual abuse, sexual abuse, misconduct

and strong inclination to be surrounded by children and young boys without other

adults present.

45. That the defendant, Diocese, was negligent in the hiring of the

defendant, Ipolito, and as a result, exposed the plaintiff, and other children and boys

13

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

within the parish to deviate sexual behavior, lewd and lascivious conduct and the

Diocese had or should have had knowledge and notice of the facts which would

cause a reasonably prudent person to refuse to retain the defendant, Ipolito,

working as a pastor, priest or mentor to young boys.

46. That had the defendant, Diocese, acted appropriately and proactively

by refusing to hire and employ the defendant, Ipolito, to serve as a priest, pastor,

mentor to boys within the parish, the plaintiff, in all likelihood, would not have been

sexually abused by the defendant, Ipolito, and the said plaintiff would not have

sustained physical, psychological and emotional injuries and other conditions as a

result therefrom.

47. That by reason of the foregoing, the plaintiff, Robert D. Planter, was

caused to become sick, sore, lame, disabled and subjected to significant physical,

psychological and emotional trauma and was prevented from attending to his usual

duties and occupation, and was compelled to secure medical care and attention and

may, in the future, be compelled to secure additional medical care and attention in

an effort to heal his said injuries all to his damage in a sum exceeding the

jurisdictional limits of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

AS AND FOR A SIXTH CAUSE OF ACTION ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF

48. That the plaintiffs repeat, reiterate and reallege each and every

allegation contained and set forth in paragraphs marked and numbered "1" through

"47", all inclusive, of this complaint with the same force and effect as though the

same were more fully set forth herein.

14

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 810183/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

49. Upon information and belief, the defendant, Diocese, with full knowledge that the defendant, Ipolito, was previously involved in sexual abuse, criminal behavior and other sexual predatory behavior against children, opted to look the other way and disregard the health and safety of its students, parishioners and boys in the community, allowing such criminal conduct to fester and continue and to allow the defendant, Ipolito, to sexually abuse the plaintiff as more fully set forth herein.

- 50. Defendant Ipolito's sexually deviant behavior and conduct which was condoned by the Diocese constitutes intentional, reckless, willful and malicious conduct on the part of the defendants, warranting an award of punitive damages.
- 51. That by reason of the foregoing, the plaintiff, Robert D. Planter, was caused to become sick, sore, lame, disabled and subjected to significant physical, psychological and emotional trauma and other conditions and was prevented from attending to his usual duties and occupation, and was compelled to secure medical care and attention and may, in the future, be compelled to secure additional medical care and attention in an effort to heal his said injuries all to his damage in a sum exceeding the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

AS AND FOR A SEVENTH CAUSE OF ACTION ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF, JANICE M. PLANTER

That the plaintiffs repeat, reiterate and reallege each and every 52. allegation contained and set forth in paragraphs marked and numbered "1" through "51", all inclusive, of this complaint with the same force and effect as though the same were more fully set forth herein.

INDEX NO. 810183/2019 ERIE COUNTY CLERK 08/14/2019

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 08/14/2019

53. That at all the times hereinafter mentioned, Janice M. Planter, was and

presently is the wife of the plaintiff, Robert D. Planter, and as such, was and still is

entitled to his services, society and companionship and was, and still is compelled to

provide for his medical care and attention and that by reason of the injuries and

damages sustained by the plaintiff, Robert D. Planter, as aforesaid, the plaintiff,

Janice M. Planter, was deprived of his services, society and companionship and was

and will be compelled to pay for his medical care and attention, in a sum exceeding

the jurisdictional limits of all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction.

WHEREFORE, the plaintiff, Robert D. Planter, demands judgment against the

defendants, Ipolito and Diocese, upon his first, second, third, fourth, fifth and sixth

causes of action hereinabove alleged in a sum exceeding the jurisdictional limits of

all lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction and the plaintiff, Janice M.

Planter, demands judgment against the defendants, Ipolito and Diocese, on her

cause of action hereinabove alleged in a sum exceeding the jurisdictional limits of all

lower courts which would otherwise have jurisdiction, together with the costs and

disbursements of this action to each of them.

Dated: August 14, 2019

Williamsville, New York

Eric B. Grossman

Law Office of Eric B. Grossman

Attorneys for Plaintiff

Office and Post Office Address

5820 Main Street, Suite 306

Williamsville, New York 14221

(716) 634-0000

16